ABSTRACT

Thyroid hot nodules are virtually always considered benign. Rare cases of hot thyroid carcinoma exist. We briefly described a clinical case and performed a review of the literature. We performed an extensive research on medical databases, such as PubMed and compiled all published cases matching preset criteria defining true hot thyroid carcinomas as well as guidelines regarding their management. We analyzed 103 articles published over the past 50 years. We selected 16 articles, including 45 cases matching our criteria. The majority were follicular carcinomas. Papillary carcinomas were infrequently found in this setting. Recommended management and survival rates were similar to classical cold thyroid cancer. Although hot nodules should continue to be considered benign most of the time, rare cases of hot thyroid cancers exist and clinicians should not hesitate to ask for additional tests if they encounter any abnormal finding. This form of thyroid cancer can reasonably be managed the same way as the cold thyroid cancers.

Keywords: Thyroid cancer, Thyroid carcinoma, Thyroid surgery, Hot thyroid nodule.

INTRODUCTION

Medical literature generally has admitted for several decades that concurrent thyroid cancer and hyperthyroidism is a rare association.1-3 The overall low incidence, however, makes it difficult to draw adequate statistics. The few larger retrospective series mention an incidence of thyroid cancer among hyperthyroid patients between 1 and 5.8%.4-8 According to the latest guidelines from the American Thyroid Association,9 hyperthyroid nodules with positive radioactive marker uptake on scintigraphy do not require fine-needle aspiration (FNA) or ultrasound evaluation because of the overall low incidence of malignancy in these lesions. Moreover, a significant number of FNA performed in hot nodules are diagnosed as ‘suspicious for a follicular neoplasm’ (category IV in the Bethesda grading system), which would result in an increased number of thyroidectomies performed for benign disease. Hot nodules are therefore considered virtually benign and managed as such in most institutions, including ours. We recently had the case of a patient with a hypersecreting thyroid nodule which was found to be a papillary carcinoma. We here describe this clinical case and take it as an opportunity to analyze and review the literature concerning this topic.

CASE REPORT

A 54-year-old, nonsmoking female patient without any significant medical history was evaluated in November 2011 for a right thyroid nodule. She did not complain of any symptoms except moderate cervical discomfort. Her vital signs were all normal and her physical examination was unremarkable except for an enlarged, painless right thyroid lobe. There were no palpable cervical lymph nodes. Laboratory measurements showed very low serum thyroid stimulating hormone (TSH) levels (0.013 mU/l, normal levels 0.340-5.60) and upper limits free tetraiodothyronine (T4) (14 pmol/l, normal levels 7.9-14.4) and triiodothyronine (T3) (6.5 pmol/l, normal levels 3.8-6.8) serum levels. An ultrasound showed a solitary, 23 × 17 × 16 mm, well-delimited, hyperechogenic nodule located at the inferior pole of the right thyroid lobe (Figs 1 and 2), without evidence of cervical lymph node enlargement. The 99mTc-pertechnetate thyroid scintigraphy was positive for a single hyperfunctional nodule located at the inferior pole of the right thyroid lobe (Figs 1 and 2), without evidence of cervical lymph node enlargement. The 99mTc-pertechnetate thyroid scintigraphy was positive for a single hyperfunctional nodule located at the inferior pole of the right thyroid lobe as well. The nodule showed increased radioactive marker uptake, whereas the remaining thyroid showed a diminished marker uptake (Fig. 3). After detailed explanations about both surgical and radioactive-iodine treatment options and their respective benefits and risks, the patient chose the surgical option. We planned a classical right thyroid lobectomy and isthmectomy for her right solitary toxic nodule.

Lobe thy DT

Fig. 1: Ultrasound image of the thyroid nodule—transverse view
During the surgical procedure, the surgeon found a very firm nodule which showed clear signs of invasion into the overlying muscles and he decided to ask for a frozen section. The nodule was diagnosed as a thyroid papillary carcinoma. The thyroid lobectomy was therefore converted to a total thyroidectomy with central neck dissection. Both laryngeal recurrent nerves were monitored electrically and preserved. The postoperative period was uneventful and the patient was discharged 1 day after surgery.

The final histopathologic examination showed a follicular variant of papillary carcinoma of the right thyroid lobe with prethyroidal muscles infiltration (Figs 4A to D). The surrounding thyroid tissue and the left lobe exhibited a totally normal architecture, without any hyperplasia or other lesion. None of the lymph nodes contained metastatic disease. The tumor-node-metastasis (TNM) staging was pT3 pN0. The patient underwent a radioactive iodine treatment in April 2012.

**MATERIALS AND METHODS**

Usual online publication databases, mainly PubMed, were used to find and analyze all previously published cases of hot thyroid cancer. The following research terms were used, either individually or in combinations: thyroid, hyperthyroidism, hot, hypersecreting, hyperfunctional, nodule, cancer, neoplasia, tumor, carcinoma, papillary, follicular.

All articles published before September 2012 were taken into consideration. According to previously published articles,10-13 we defined the following three criteria to define true cases of hypersecreting thyroid carcinoma: localized increased radioactive marker uptake on scintigraphy, decreased TSH levels and complete coincidence on histopathologic examination between the hypersecreting thyroid tissue and the thyroid carcinoma. Cases matching all three criteria were then compiled, including authors, date of publication, number of cases and histopathology of thyroid cancer.

Consensus papers and guidelines about hot thyroid cancers from recognized surgical and medical endocrine associations were searched and compiled as well.

**RESULTS**

A preliminary unfiltered search resulted in 103 articles related to hot thyroid carcinoma, published between October 1958 and September 2012.

All cases reporting thyroid cancer in hyperthyroid contexts like Grave’s disease or Hashimoto thyroiditis were excluded as well as articles with insufficient information to evaluate our criteria and articles which did not describe clinical cases. This first filtering process selected 31 articles, describing a total of 69 reported cases of solitary toxic nodules associated with thyroid carcinoma. Out of these cases,
31 articles, 16 articles (five series of cases and 11 case reports) included cases matching the previously mentioned criteria for a total of 45 reported cases.6,7,11-24

Among these 45 cases, the histological repartition was as follow: 25 (56%) follicular carcinoma, 16 (36%) papillary carcinoma including at least four (9%) confirmed follicular variant, two (4%) Hürthle cells thyroid cancer, one (2%) poorly differentiated thyroid cancer and we were not able to find the histology for one case (Table 1).

One article6 performed a survival analysis based on 19 cases and found similar matched 6-year survival rates compared to patients with cold thyroid cancer.

Two articles suggested a higher prevalence of cancer in hot nodules in children.13,25

Guidelines about the management of hot thyroid cancers were found in three articles, all of which were consensus articles from major surgical and medical associations.9,26,27

**DISCUSSION**

Our results confirm that hot thyroid carcinoma is a rare disease. The low number of cases and the absence of larger series explain the lack of solid data and well designed clinical trials. As mentioned before, the incidence appears to be somewhere between 1 and 6% in patients with hyperthyroidism, with a probably higher figure among children.

The definition of hypersecreting thyroid carcinoma or hot thyroid cancer has been matter of debate for more than a decade.9 As mentioned by Lupi and al,10 it is important to distinguish between real cases of hot thyroid cancers and other situations like a coexisting thyroid carcinoma and toxic nodule, a carcinoma inside a toxic nodule or a carcinoma related to forms of hyperthyroidism that are not caused by hyperfunctional nodules. This is the rationale explaining the three criteria chosen to identify true cases of hot thyroid carcinoma respectively, the exclusion of the cases describing patients with Grave’s disease or Hashimoto thyroiditis. The case we reported above fulfills all these criteria. As mentioned previously, 69 cases of solitary toxic nodules associated with thyroid carcinoma were found, among which 24 cases were excluded because they did not match the selected criteria, leaving the 45 cases presented in Table 1.

The larger series6,7 show a higher prevalence of follicular thyroid carcinomas, which represent more than half (56%) of all cases we found. Since hot thyroid papillary carcinomas are found less frequently, they seem to be more often published as individual clinical cases: 11 out of 18 published case reports were papillary carcinomas. A significant fraction of these papillary carcinomas (minimum 25%, probably more since the subtype of all papillary carcinomas could not be found), including those found in the larger series, are of the follicular variant. A possible explanation may be that the follicular variant produces more colloid than the conventional papillary carcinoma, in which colloid depletion is relatively common.

The guidelines set by major medical and surgical associations about the management of thyroid cancer are not very extensive about hot thyroid cancers and recognize the lack of data and properly designed studies in this field. No specific management for hot thyroid cancer is suggested. There is a general agreement that hot nodules should be considered benign and treated as such and, therefore, not undergo additional tests, such as FNA or ultrasound evaluation. Experts recommend the same management as classical thyroid carcinoma, primarily surgery followed by radioactive iodine therapy if needed (grade C recommendation).

In our opinion, clinicians should always look for abnormal and nonconcordant clinical and/or radiologic findings when faced with a hot thyroid nodule. Suspicious elements are similar to those encountered in classical forms of thyroid cancer and include symptoms, such as local pain, dyspnea, dysphonia or dysphagia, palpation of enlarged cervical lymph nodes, ultrasound findings, such as irregularly

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Year of publication</th>
<th>Number of cases</th>
<th>Histology of cancer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Karanchi et al14</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Hürthle cell</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Damle et al13</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Papillary (subtype not found)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yalla et al15</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Hürthle cell</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Giovanella et al16</td>
<td>2010</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Follicular</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bommireddipalli et al17</td>
<td>2010</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Papillary, follicular variant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Azevedo et al18</td>
<td>2010</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Papillary, follicular variant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uludag et al19</td>
<td>2008</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Papillary, columnary type</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nishida et al12</td>
<td>2008</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Papillary (subtype not found)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low et al20</td>
<td>2005</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Poorly differentiated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Als et al25</td>
<td>2002</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>14 follicular, 3 papillary including 2 follicular variant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lupi et al11</td>
<td>2002</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Not found</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cirillo et al21</td>
<td>1998</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Papillary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ikekubo et al22</td>
<td>1989</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Papillary (subtype not found)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smith et al23</td>
<td>1988</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Follicular</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sandler et al24</td>
<td>1988</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Papillary (subtype not found)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rösler et al7</td>
<td>1984</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8 follicular, 2 papillary (subtype not found)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
shaped tumor or invasion of surrounding structures. These findings should lead to additional tests, such as FNA or further radiologic studies. Sometimes, as was the case with the patient we described in this article, abnormal elements are found only during the operation. In this case, the surgeon should not hesitate to ask for a frozen section.

According to a survival analysis of 19 patients, the 5-year survival rate of patients with hot thyroid cancer treated by surgical resection followed by radioactive iodine is not significantly different after matching when compared to patients with classical cold thyroid cancer who received the same treatment. It seems therefore reasonable to follow the same guidelines and standard of care used for cold thyroid cancers. Once again, however, the relatively small number of cases makes it difficult to draw adequate conclusions and larger cohorts of patients would be required to establish specific guidelines.

CONCLUSION

Our conclusion is that although it is difficult to assess the real incidence of hot thyroid carcinomas, they seem to be very rare. About 40 well-documented cases fulfilling all the necessary criteria are reported in the medical literature over the past 50 years. Most of them are follicular carcinoma. The current guidelines, which consider hot nodules to be virtually always benign, need not be changed in our opinion but clinicians should keep in mind the possibility of a malignant hot nodule and perform additional diagnostic procedures if there are any suspicious or nonconcordant findings in the preoperative assessment and workup. The surgeon should be aware of that rare possibility and use frozen section liberally if he finds any suspicious morphologic signs. If the hot nodule is diagnosed as a thyroid carcinoma, it should be managed according to the current guidelines for classical cold thyroid carcinomas.

REFERENCES


ABOUT THE AUTHORS

Pouya Iranmanesh (Corresponding Author)
Resident, Department of Thoracic and Endocrine Surgery Geneva University Hospitals, Geneva, Switzerland, e-mail: pouyairanmanesh@hcuge.ch

Marc Pusztaszeri
Senior Attending, Department of Pathology, Geneva University Hospitals, Geneva, Switzerland

John Robert
Professor, Department of Thoracic and Endocrine Surgery, Geneva University Hospitals, Geneva, Switzerland

Patrick Meyer
Senior Attending, Department of Endocrinology, Geneva University Hospitals, Geneva, Switzerland

Boris Schiltz
Resident, Department of Thoracic and Endocrine Surgery, Geneva University Hospitals, Geneva, Switzerland

Samira Mercedes Sadowski
Resident, Department of Thoracic and Endocrine Surgery, Geneva University Hospitals, Geneva, Switzerland

Michel Olivier Goumaz
Private Practice, Geneva, Switzerland

Frederic Triponez
Senior Attending with Private Docent, Department of Thoracic and Endocrine Surgery, Geneva University Hospitals, Geneva, Switzerland